



**Convention on the Elimination
of All Forms of Discrimination
against Women**

Distr.: General
6 April 2005

Original: English

**Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination
against Women**
Thirty-second session

Summary record of the 678th meeting

Held at Headquarters, New York, on Thursday, 20 January 2005, at 3 p.m.

Chairperson: Ms. Belmihoub-Zerdani (Vice-Chairperson)

Contents

Consideration of reports submitted by States parties under article 18 of the
Convention (*continued*)

Combined fourth and fifth periodic reports of Turkey (continued)

This record is subject to correction.

Corrections should be submitted in one of the working languages. They should be set forth in a memorandum and also incorporated in a copy of the record. They should be sent *within one week of the date of this document* to the Chief, Official Records Editing Section, room DC2-750, 2 United Nations Plaza.

Any corrections to the record of the meetings of this session will be consolidated in a single corrigendum, to be issued shortly after the end of the session.

05-21471 (E)

0521471

In the absence of the Chairperson, Ms. Belmihoub-Zerdani (Vice-Chairperson), took the Chair.

The meeting was called to order at 3 p.m.

Consideration of reports submitted by States parties under article 18 of the Convention (continued)

(CEDAW/C/TUR/4-5,
CEDAW/PSWG/2005/I/CRP.1/Add.8 and
CEDAW/PSWG/2005/I/CRP.2/Add.7)

Combined fourth and fifth periodic reports of Turkey (continued)

1. *At the invitation of the Chairperson, the members of the delegation of Turkey took places at the Committee table.*

Articles 7 to 9

2. **Ms. Gaspard** said although Turkey had been a leader in women's rights in the 1920s, when women had been granted the right to vote and to hold office, little progress seemed to have been made since. There were very few women parliamentarians or locally elected officials, and despite the active role played by women in civil society and non-governmental organizations they were poorly represented at political decision-making levels. She wondered whether any research had been undertaken to explain that poor representation and whether the political parties were considering quotas to increase women's representation. Given Turkey's role as an example in the region and the fact that article 10 of the Constitution granted men and women equal rights and article 90 gave supremacy to international conventions, the State party should consider the use of temporary special measures such as quotas to ensure equal representation of women in political life as well as in the administration.

3. **Ms. Zou Xiaqiao** welcomed the State party's determination to implement the Convention and stressed the importance of ensuring that women played an important role in both public and political life throughout the country. She wondered whether any studies had been undertaken of how eager women were to enter political life, whether the public supported women playing a greater role in political life and whether the State party had any plans to promote a greater role for women in political and public life, in cooperation with non-governmental organizations. She

suggested that temporary special measures might be needed to promote that goal.

4. **Ms. Šimonović** recalled the State party's obligation under article 7 of the Convention to eliminate discrimination, whether direct or indirect, against women in political life. The participation rates for women in political life were so low that there clearly seemed to be at least indirect discrimination against women. Referring to article 8 of the Convention, she noted that only 12 per cent of ambassadors were women and asked how that situation could be explained.

5. **Ms. Akşit** (Turkey) said the prevailing political culture could explain women's low participation rate in politics despite Turkey's early leadership role in women's rights; the political parties did in fact wish to increase the role played by women in the political process. Quotas might be a solution but participation in political life was not the only way to measure the participation of women in society. There were no real barriers to women's participation in political life and a woman who so desired had just as much chance to succeed as a man. With regard to articles 10 and 90 of the Constitution, she stressed that her Government was fully aware of its responsibility to promote gender equality and of the option of implementing specific measures at its discretion.

6. **Mr. Ates** (Turkey), referring to the number of women ambassadors, said ambassadors were usually appointed on the basis of seniority; since there were currently relatively few women at the higher levels of the diplomatic service, there were few women ambassadors. Those figures should increase in the near future, since 23 per cent of current heads of department were women, who could logically expect to be named ambassadors after several years' service. Over the preceding four years, more than one third of new recruits to the diplomatic service had been women.

7. **Ms. Yesildaglar** (Turkey) said that, although there had been no legislation per se concerning temporary special measures, in practice specific measures had been taken to improve the situation of women. The Ministry of Labour and Social Security, for example, in a 50 million euro project co-financed by Turkey and the European Union, had provided grants to promote employment for groups such as the unemployed, young people and also women. Women were being encouraged to take entrance exams for

government positions and exams were currently being used to provide objective criteria for promotion for government employees; women were encouraged to take such exams. In addition, in order to ensure equal treatment for women when they entered the labour market, in 2004 the Prime Minister's office had issued a circular prohibiting employers from advertising positions for men only.

8. **Ms. Akşit** (Turkey) reiterated that in order to increase employment of women, the Directorate General for the Status and Problems of Women had prioritized the promotion of employment for women and, upon recommendation of the Directorate General, the Prime Minister's office had issued its circular on non-discrimination in job advertisements.

9. **Ms. Odyakmaz** (Turkey), referring to the issue of temporary special measures, said that in a case involving a complaint of discriminatory treatment in favour of women, the Constitutional Court had upheld an enterprise's right to ignore the normally guaranteed principle of equality of treatment and implement measures aimed at correcting gender imbalance. Temporary special measures such as quotas in the electoral law to promote the participation of women in politics would be possible given the Court's discretionary power to interpret the Constitution in the light of the Convention.

Articles 10 to 14

10. **Ms. Gabr** applauded the extension of compulsory basic education to eight years of schooling but requested more information on the patriarchal values and unfavourable economic conditions which adversely affected the educational status of girls, as indicated in the written report (CEDAW/C/TUR/4-5, p. 22). She stressed that education was a fundamental human right to which girls should have equal access and wondered whether the extension of compulsory schooling to a total of eight years had benefited all women, including from all social classes and in all the provinces. She requested further information on the banning of the head scarf for girls, including the situation in private schools and institutions and higher education. She also suggested that distance education could be a viable alternative for ensuring that all women had access to educational opportunities.

11. **Ms. Gaspard** said that despite efforts to eliminate illiteracy and promote basic education, more

than 20 per cent of the female population, both rural and urban, was illiterate (CEDAW/C/TUR/4-5, p. 21), and many girls either did not attend school or did not attend for the full eight-year compulsory period; in rural or remote areas, long distances from the nearest school constituted a form of indirect discrimination against rural girls. She wondered what the State party was doing to remedy the situation, improve literacy rates among women, make sure all girls attended and stayed in school and eliminate stereotyping in choice of field of study.

12. Turning to the issue of the situation of minority women, she noted that in the State party's response to the Committee's question No. 17 (CEDAW/PSWG/2005/I/CRP.2/Add.7, p. 12), it was stated that there was no discrimination based on ethnic origin in Turkey and that no data was collected based on ethnic origin. However, as in all countries, there were minorities, including ethnic minorities such as the Kurds who spoke their own language and were especially prevalent in rural areas. She wondered what the integration rate into Turkish society was for such groups, especially women from those groups.

13. Finally, with regard to response No. 26 on the wearing of the headscarf (CEDAW/PSWG/2005/I/CRP.2/Add.7, pp. 19-20), although regulation No. 17537 required female students' heads to be uncovered and regulation No. 17849 required women employees in public offices and institutions to leave their heads uncovered, she expressed concern that such provisions were incompatible with the right to equal access to education and employment. An adult woman who chose to wear a headscarf might be excluded from employment in some jobs and a minor girl who was required to wear a headscarf by her family could be excluded from school.

14. **Ms. Popescu** welcomed the substantial progress achieved by Turkey, particularly with respect to legal reforms. However, there were still serious discrepancies between girls and boys regarding access to various forms of education. In that regard, she wondered what measures had been taken by the Government to ensure the implementation of the law on compulsory primary education. Noting that girls were mostly enrolled in humanities courses while boys were enrolled in technical courses, she wanted to know what measures the Government was taking to eliminate that stereotypical approach to education, which also adversely affected women's employment opportunities.

She would also appreciate any information on specific measures taken to encourage girls who interrupted their studies as a result of early marriage or pregnancy to resume such studies.

15. **Mr. Flinterman** sought clarification on the new Penal Code regarding the issue of custom or honour crimes.

16. **Ms. Shin** said that the next report of Turkey should contain figures on school attendance rates not only according to urban and rural areas but also by region. She was surprised to learn that a lack of interest in school was the main reason why children were not attending school. Other reasons given included domestic chores and lack of permission from the family. She would be interested in knowing what steps the Government was taking to address that issue. In that regard, it would be interesting to know whether any studies had been undertaken to identify the reasons for the low rate of women's employment. She would also appreciate information on childcare facilities.

17. **Ms. Arocha Domínguez** wondered whether there were any indicators that would provide a comprehensive analysis of the conditions of work of women in the agricultural labour force and whether any studies had been carried out regarding women's income both in terms of paid and unpaid work. She would also welcome information on the percentage of women's income in relation to social security and on any study conducted, especially in rural areas, on the real impact of the headscarf ban on female school attendance.

18. **Ms. Akşit** (Turkey) noted that boys and girls had always had equal opportunities in terms of both basic and higher education. Overall, the education level of girls was lower than that of boys mainly due to economic and cultural factors. In lower income areas, families gave priority to boys over girls. To address that situation, the Government provided higher cash incentives to families who sent their daughters to school. That policy had led to a significant increase in attendance of girls of 21.9 per cent. The Government had also designed measures to eliminate that preference, which had resulted in an increase of 134 per cent of girls attending middle school for instance. The target for 2010 was 100 per cent participation of girls. There were a number of other programmes, including one co-sponsored by UNICEF. In all regions of Turkey, including urban areas, there was a difference

between the level of school attendance for girls and boys.

19. **Ms. Atabay** (Turkey) said that in the 2002-2003 academic year, the Government had provided free textbooks to students from poor families and had established primary boarding schools for children from poor families and primary-school-age children in villages and settlements that did not have any schools. Some 230 such boarding schools had been opened. A survey conducted among primary school girls indicated that they wanted to attend secondary school. Furthermore, in the 2003-2004 academic year, the Ministry of Education had provided some 2,105 adult literacy courses. Sixty-one per cent of the participants had been women.

20. **Ms. Yesildaglar** (Turkey) acknowledged that the current rate of female participation in the labour force, 26.6 per cent, was very low. However, female employment was not always visible, as most women performed unregistered, unrecorded work or had flexible patterns of work. Consequently, the figures did not necessarily provide a proper picture of the labour market situation. Until the recent amendment of the Labour Code, all types of informal employment, including part-time work and fixed-time work, had been excluded from the scope of the Code.

21. Integration into the European labour strategy would be yet another step towards increasing female participation in the labour force. Turkey had developed a very comprehensive report on its labour market situation, including an extensive analysis of the reasons for women's lower employment rates. The next step would be for the Government to prepare priorities and commitments to promote women's employment. Concerning social security benefits for female agricultural workers, she noted that because of the very traditional nature of agricultural work in Turkey, farms, which were usually family enterprises, were very difficult to incorporate into the scope of the Labour Code. However, the Government was contemplating the adoption of other forms of protection, such as the provision of health insurance for all. Under the Labour Code, enterprises with 150 female workers or more had to open childcare facilities for the children of such workers.

22. **Ms. Koseli** (Turkey), referring to health care, said that the main focus of the Ministry of Health was on reducing under-five infant mortality rates, especially

neo-natal mortality, by preventing problems such as diarrhoea. Workplaces that had more than 150 female employees must, in addition to establishing a kindergarten, also provide breastfeeding rooms.

23. **Ms. Yesildaglar** (Turkey) said that by law, all those in registered formal employment must be covered under the social security system. If anything at all, there was positive discrimination in favour of women. Coverage had recently been extended to self-employed women in the agricultural sector and the condition that they had to be the head of a family to receive benefits had been abolished. Moreover, the number of unpaid family workers had fallen considerably from 70 per cent in 1988 to 49 per cent in 2003. Women were increasingly moving into the service sector and the number of self-employed women had risen considerably.

24. **Ms. Atabay** (Turkey) said that girls under 18 who had left school as a result of early pregnancy or marriage were allowed to attend classes or resume their studies. Indeed, given that primary education was compulsory, families that prevented their children from attending school were fined. In the rural areas, the Ministry of Education had launched the busing primary education project in the 1989/90 school year to provide education to primary school-aged children living in less populated or sparsely settled areas. In primary education, the wearing of scarves by girls was forbidden by law. There were no private universities for girls wearing scarves.

25. **Ms. Akşit** (Turkey) said that all schools under the Ministry of Education had a dress code for both boys and girls. While there were private universities, there were no such rules in universities in general.

26. **Ms. Aytac** (Turkey) said that, while the number of honour killings had declined, the provision under which leniency was granted to those who committed crimes in the heat of anger or as a result of deep sadness caused by an unjust provocation was not applicable to perpetrators of honour killings, which were premeditated acts.

27. **Ms. Dairiam** said that, bearing in mind the obstacles posed by the economic crisis, natural disasters and the persistence of stereotypical attitudes and discriminatory practices, she would like to know how far women's economic rights had been integrated into the various components of Turkey's Five Year Development Plan. It was clear that the State had not

yet fully complied with its legal obligation to ensure economic equality between women and men, since women were still subject to horizontal and vertical segregation in the workplace, were denied opportunities for promotion and continued to earn lower wages than their male counterparts. She wished to know how the Government planned to address the situation in a holistic manner and, in particular, what steps were envisaged to lessen the impact of the economic crisis on women and to integrate them into the macroeconomic network.

28. **Ms. Tavares da Silva** asked whether research had identified any particular impediments to women's employment, such as the need to obtain the consent of their husbands or hidden social pressures and pointed out that, according to a survey carried out by a non-governmental organization, 55 per cent of adult women in Turkey still requested permission from their husbands before leaving the house. In addition, women working in the informal sector did not have access to childcare.

29. She would be grateful for more information about the action taken by the Turkish Government to establish vocational training programmes for women. Although gender equality was one of the pillars of the Government's employment strategy, not enough had been done to address the specific situation of women in the workplace from a cultural point of view. In that regard, she wondered whether a plan of action would be developed to deal with that issue in a holistic manner.

30. Lastly, while acknowledging that cultural change took time, she stressed that time alone was not sufficient. Without positive action, it would take 227 years to achieve gender parity in the Turkish Parliament.

31. **Ms. Schöpp-Schilling** wished to know what percentage of children between the ages of three and five years benefited from public or private childcare. Referring to a new law on compulsory insurance for self-employed agricultural workers, she enquired as to the precise definition of a "self-employed agricultural worker". She also asked about the level of insurance premiums and wondered whether the absence of employer contributions meant that the individuals concerned were required to make double payments.

32. According to the report, "needy" rural women qualified for a State pension. She asked what criteria

used to determine “neediness” and wondered whether the pension was payable to married as well as single women. She noted that over 80 per cent of rural women employed in agriculture were unpaid family workers and, in that connection, urged the Government to take steps to ensure that those women were not subject to indirect discrimination.

33. **Ms. Patten** observed that the report referred to a weakening of labour unions in Turkey. In that connection, she wished to know what measures had been taken by the Government to promote the election of women to official positions within trades unions and what steps had been taken to ensure the job security and physical safety of female nominees.

34. What had the Ministry of Labour and Social Security done to eliminate gender-based occupational segregation and to promote women’s participation in skilled professions and in non-traditional sectors, particularly the scientific and technical fields? Did the Ministry support any specific programmes designed to enhance self-reliance among minority groups of women? She would be grateful to know whether women had equal access to workplace training programmes and whether any measures had been taken to provide training for unemployed women and those re-entering the labour market.

35. Referring to the private sector, she enquired how the Government ensured that employment contracts were granted on a non-discriminatory basis, that women were recruited to fill managerial positions and that all relevant legislation affecting women in the workplace was observed.

36. **Ms. Manalo** said that, while she respected the Turkish Government’s approach to the issue of minorities, she could not accept it, since marginalized women, including those of Kurdish origin, affinity and extraction and those of other ethnic minorities, were subject to multiple forms of discrimination, the most serious of which was due to their status as women. She assumed that, in view of Turkey’s desire to accede to the European Union and the consequent need to demonstrate its respect for the principles of democracy, human rights, good governance and the rule of law, the Turkish Government had developed a political vision that addressed the issue of marginalized women. She would be interested to hear more about that vision and requested information about specific measures designed to integrate the women in question into

mainstream society and to ensure the enjoyment of their human rights.

37. **Mr. Ilkin** (Turkey) said that he stood by his earlier statements about the composition of the Turkish nation and the absence of any discrimination in the country based on race, although no one would deny that some groups in the country were better off and some groups of women needed extra help. Throughout the day his Government’s report had been thoroughly scrutinized and the reforms Turkey had undertaken had been recognized. If the subject of marginalization had to be broached, the only marginalization had been that of the discussions, by one particular member of the Committee.

38. **Ms. Akşit** (Turkey) said that she agreed that the subject of marginalization was not relevant and was being politicized.

39. **Ms. Morvai** said that Turkish men should be made aware of the double standards inherent in their attitudes towards women, since, on the one hand, they were obsessed with the need to protect women’s virginity yet, on the other hand, licensed prostitution was legal. In that connection, she asked whether any programmes were in place to enlighten men about the intolerability of that double standard and the need to refrain from using women’s bodies as objects.

40. The report stated that brothel owners were responsible for taking the necessary measures to prevent sexually transmitted diseases and that female sex workers were subject to regular examinations to determine whether or not they were infected with such diseases. Such arrangements were clearly discriminatory, since two people were involved in the sexual act and clients could easily infect women with sexually transmitted diseases or HIV/AIDS.

41. **Ms. Yesildaglar** (Turkey) acknowledged that the female employment rate in Turkey was unsatisfactory but stressed that the Government was doing everything possible to improve the situation. Women in the workplace enjoyed de jure equality, since article 5 of the Turkish Labour Code prohibited any form of discrimination for the duration of a “business relationship”, or from the conclusion of an employment contract to its termination, and a lower wage for identical work or work of an equal value was not permitted for reasons of gender. However, in practice, inequalities remained, particularly in the informal sector, and there was a consequent need to raise

awareness among all concerned. In 2004, the Government had produced two reports on informal and unregistered employment and efforts were currently under way to develop an action plan to address that particular problem area.

42. **Ms. Akşit** (Turkey) said that the 8th Five Year Development Plan contained specific measures to increase women's participation in the workforce. Nevertheless, although civil law allowed women the freedom to choose whether or not to engage in business activities, the situation was rather different in practice, since domestic responsibilities tended to complicate matters. Accordingly, efforts were under way to implement programmes that encouraged women to find ways of balancing paid employment with domestic tasks and to provide technical training.

43. **Ms. Yesildaglar** (Turkey), in response to the remarks made by Ms. Schöpp-Schilling, said that all self-employed workers were obliged to take out insurance. Employed workers were subject to a different system.

44. **Ms. Akşit** (Turkey) said that, while the Turkish Government certainly wished to encourage women to take a more active role in trades unions, the question of women's participation in such unions fell within the purview of non-governmental organizations.

45. **Ms. Yesildaglar** (Turkey) pointed out that, according to the most recent statistics from the Ministry of Labour and Social Security, 44 per cent of women participated in trades union organizations as compared to 43.4 per cent of men. Women had no difficulty obtaining membership of such organizations but were often unable to secure managerial positions. In order to address that issue, the largest Turkish trades union had established a women's platform and was conducting an opinion poll in order to ascertain why so few women occupied decision-making positions.

46. **Ms. Akşit** (Turkey) said that she could not at the moment provide any data on health care for children between the ages of three and six. With regard to the double standard in Turkey in the treatment of sexually transmitted diseases, she herself was not convinced that it was a problem.

47. **Mr. Kurnaz** (Turkey) said that the health of prostitutes working in brothels was carefully monitored and that they were frequently tested for sexually

transmitted diseases as a protective measure. Those found to be infected had their licences revoked.

Articles 15 and 16 of the Convention

48. **Ms. Tan** asked how many complaints of family violence had been made and protection orders issued, how many women had suffered violence and how many perpetrators had been convicted and the nature of their penalties, under the Law on the Protection of the Family (report, pp. 4 and 7). Did the Government have an overall plan to set up more shelters for battered women, which were admittedly inadequate: in the municipalities of over 50,000 inhabitants where the Government planned to start, what would be the requirements and arrangements within the shelters and who would monitor their impact on families; was there any rehabilitation programme for perpetrators, including ex-spouses, and were enforcement officers, medical personnel, prosecutors and judges trained and sensitized?

49. **Ms. Coker-Appiah** said that she welcomed the new Civil Code in Turkey, as marriage was a social institution in which women's human rights were regularly violated. However, although the age for civil marriage had been raised, there were, according to outside information, many marriages without civil standing performed according to religious rites, especially in Anatolia, where young child-brides were involved. Also, widows continued to be forced to marry their brothers-in-law; polygamy existed. Laws alone would not lead to true equality and therefore the Government had to act urgently to address cultural practices that were in conflict with the law, perhaps starting with surveys of the actual situation.

50. **Ms. Dairiam** asked what further steps the Government was taking to allow women actually to benefit from the number of positive provisions in both the Constitution and the labour legislation. Businesses were forbidden to discriminate against women, but nothing had been said about any controls over discriminatory actions by other private institutions and other individuals, as called for in article 2 (e) of the Convention. She would like to know what was being done to apply article 5 of Turkey's Constitution, which demanded removal of restrictions to equal rights and the creation of the necessary conditions for equality; whether monitoring mechanisms had been set up to identify obstacles to women's equality and the kinds of data that needed to be collected had been determined,

whether the courts had been given the capacity to rule on failures to act as well as positive offences or to create the necessary conditions, and whether it was necessary standards. The Government should adopt a gender equality law providing comprehensive mechanisms for compliance with the Constitution, including the appointment of an Ombudsperson for gender equality.

51. **Ms. Gnacadja** asked for further clarification on matrimonial property rights and on the possibility in the course of the marriage for the two spouses to revise the property arrangements. The report gave good information on the reform of the family law, but a comparative assessment of the de facto situation would also be welcome, with regard to enduring patriarchal values such as polygamy, levirate and early marriage.

52. **Ms. Akşit** (Turkey) said that, while she could not provide full statistics on the incidence of domestic violence in Turkey, the Government was collecting data from national and local administrations throughout the country on the number of cases and the causes, and she could report that, since the adoption of the 1998 Law on the Protection of the Family, over 18,000 cases had been heard. The Government was working on preventing domestic violence. All public institutions had, for instance, participated in a national media campaign, on television and in the newspapers, to raise awareness and a subcommission would soon present its findings. Also, given the importance of religious practices in the country, religious leaders had been instructed to speak out at Friday prayers against domestic violence. Rehabilitation of the perpetrators was, of course, needed and the Government intended to develop such a programme. The Ministry of Justice had started to provide social and psychological counselling in prisons, and social workers, health-care professionals and the police were being trained to recognize the signs of domestic violence.

53. The Government was encouraging local authorities to take some responsibility for the inadequacy of shelters: thus far, over 300 cities with a population of over 50,000 had one or more shelters, which the Government would continue to monitor even as it opened new ones, as needed. No further specific data was currently available.

54. Regarding the ongoing legal reform, the National Action Plan on Education, Health and Employment of 1996 was currently being updated.

55. **Ms. Gaspard** recalled that Turkey had made a declaration concerning nationality in connection with article 9, paragraph 1, when it had ratified the Convention, and she wondered whether the revision of the Law on Nationality would bring it into line with the Convention. Also, when women sought asylum, could they act autonomously or must their petition be linked to that of their husbands; and were threats of forced marriage or of female genital mutilation considered grounds for granting asylum?

56. **Ms. Atabay** (Turkey) said that education was compulsory until the age of 15, with possible attendance until 17, and that persons beyond that age could attend general, primary and secondary education courses open to them.

57. **Ms. Akşit** (Turkey) said that 93 per cent of marriages in Turkey were recognized civil marriages and only 7.5 per cent were religious marriages that had no standing under the law, but which the Government was trying to record as unofficial marriages. Polygamy was absolutely illegal under the Criminal Code, and was subject to imprisonment of 6 months to 2 years.

58. **Ms. Odyakmaz** (Turkey) said that for a marriage to be legal in Turkey it must take place before a civil official acting as witness. Both the former and the revised Criminal Code established penalties for any person entering into a religious marriage before a civil marriage, as well as for the religious officiate at such a marriage.

59. The Ministry of Justice and its human rights division had established commissions in 1997 and again in 2004 to draft an Ombudsman Act, which had now been completed in the form of a bill, providing for 1 ombudsman and 5 to 10 assistant ombudsmen, whose division of work, including the area of gender equality, would be regulated subsequently by by-laws rather than in the legislation itself.

60. **Ms. Akşit** (Turkey) said that in order to empower women and to narrow the gender gap, the Government had set up community centres in about 30 cities, family resources centres in about 20 cities and, in about 10 cities, special educational centres for women which offered basic education in human rights and also vocational training.

61. **Ms. Cinar** (Turkey) said that the 2002 revision of both the Citizenship Act and article 66 of the

Constitution had done away with discriminatory provisions.

62. **Mr. Ates** (Turkey) said that the legal reforms of 2002 had obviated the need for the declaration concerning article 9 of the Convention, and all discrimination against women had been eliminated from the nationality laws.

63. **Ms. Manalo**, observing that a member of the Turkish delegation had accused a Committee expert of marginalizing the discussion throughout the day, said that such a personal attack had no place in a civilized debate and that furthermore, as all could attest, it was groundless. She would attribute such a reaction simply to the delegation's inability to answer the questions she had raised regarding Turkey's political vision.

64. **The Chairperson** explained that the members of the Committee asked questions of delegations based on the Convention in order to advance its implementation by States parties both in law and in practice. It was the Committee's duty to verify whether States parties had progressed domestically, and its interest was only to advance the cause of women. She would share Turkey's pride if it could expand the presence of women in Parliament and generally make women more visible in the Government, for that would help Turkish men and Turkish society at large.

65. She thanked the members of the delegation for their constructive dialogue with the Committee.

The meeting rose at 5.35 p.m.