

# EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION - TEMPORARY SPECIAL MEASURES (AFFIRMATIVE ACTION)

## II. GENERAL COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

- CERD General Recommendation VIII (Thirty-eighth session, 1990): Concerning the Interpretation and Application of Article 1, Paragraphs 1 and 4, of the Convention, A/45/18 (1990) 79.

The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination,

Having considered reports from States parties concerning information about the ways in which individuals are identified as being members of a particular racial or ethnic groups or groups,

Is of the opinion that such identification shall, if no justification exists to the contrary, be based upon self-identification by the individual concerned.

- CERD General Recommendation XIV (Forty-second session, 1993): On Article 1, Paragraph 1, of the Convention, A/48/18 (1993) 114 at para. 2.

...

2. The Committee observes that a differentiation of treatment will not constitute discrimination if the criteria for such differentiation, judged against the objectives and purposes of the Convention, are legitimate or fall within the scope of article 1, paragraph 4, of the Convention. In considering the criteria that may have been employed, the Committee will acknowledge that particular actions may have varied purposes. In seeking to determine whether an action has an effect contrary to the Convention, it will look to see whether that action has an unjustifiable disparate impact upon a group distinguished by race, colour, descent, or national or ethnic origin.

- CERD General Recommendation XXX (Sixty-fifth session, 2004): Discrimination Against Non-Citizens, A/59/18 (2004) 93 at para. 4.

...

[The Committee]...[a]ffirms that:

...

4. Under the Convention, differential treatment based on citizenship or immigration status will constitute discrimination if the criteria for such differentiation, judged in the light of the objectives and purposes of the Convention, are not applied pursuant to a legitimate aim, and

## **EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION - TEMPORARY SPECIAL MEASURES (AFFIRMATIVE ACTION)**

are not proportional to the achievement of this aim. Differentiation within the scope of article 1, paragraph 4, of the Convention relating to special measures is not considered discriminatory;

...

- ICCPR General Comment 4 (Thirteenth session, 1981): Article 3: Equality Between the Sexes, A/36/40 (1981) 109 at para. 2.

...

2. Firstly, article 3, as articles 2 (1) and 26 in so far as those articles primarily deal with the prevention of discrimination on a number of grounds, among which sex is one, requires not only measures of protection but also affirmative action designed to ensure the positive enjoyment of rights. This cannot be done simply by enacting laws. Hence, more information has generally been required regarding the role of women in practice with a view to ascertaining what measures, in addition to purely legislative measures of protection, have been or are being taken to give effect to the precise and positive obligations under article 3 and to ascertain what progress is being made or what factors or difficulties are being met in this regard.

- ICCPR General Comment 18 (Thirty-seventh session, 1989): Non-Discrimination, A/45/40 vol. I (1990) 173 at para. 10.

...

10. The Committee also wishes to point out that the principle of equality sometimes requires States parties to take affirmative action in order to diminish or eliminate conditions which cause or help to perpetuate discrimination prohibited by the Covenant. For example, in a State where the general conditions of a certain part of the population prevent or impair their enjoyment of human rights, the State should take specific action to correct those conditions. Such action may involve granting for a time to the part of the population concerned certain preferential treatment in specific matters as compared with the rest of the population. However, as long as such action is needed to correct discrimination in fact, it is a case of legitimate differentiation under the Covenant.

## **EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION - TEMPORARY SPECIAL MEASURES (AFFIRMATIVE ACTION)**

- ICCPR General Comment 25 (Fifty-seventh session, 1996): Article 25: The Right to Participate in Public Affairs, Voting Rights and the Right of Equal Access to Public Service, A/51/40 vol. I (1996) 98 at para. 23.

...

23. Subparagraph (c) of article 25 deals with the right and the opportunity of citizens to have access on general terms of equality to public service positions. To ensure access on general terms of equality, the criteria and processes for appointment, promotion, suspension and dismissal must be objective and reasonable. Affirmative measures may be taken in appropriate cases to ensure that there is equal access to public service for all citizens. Basing access to public service on equal opportunity and general principles of merit, and providing secured tenure, ensures that persons holding public service positions are free from political interference or pressures. It is of particular importance to ensure that persons do not suffer discrimination in the exercise of their rights under article 25, subparagraph (c), on any of the grounds set out in article 2, paragraph 1.

- ICESCR General Comment 13 (Twenty-first session, 1999): Article 13: The Right to Education, E/2000/22 (1999) 111 at para. 32.

...

32. The adoption of temporary special measures intended to bring about *de facto* equality for men and women, and disadvantaged groups, is not a violation of the right to non-discrimination with regard to education, so long as such measures do not lead to the maintenance of unequal or separate standards for different groups, and provided they are not continued after the objectives for which they were taken have been achieved.

- CEDAW General Recommendation 5 (Seventh session, 1988): Temporary Special Measures, A/43/38 (1988) 109.

The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women,

Taking note that the reports, the introductory remarks and the replies by States parties reveal that while significant progress has been achieved in regard to repealing or modifying discriminatory laws, there is still a need for action to be taken to implement fully the Convention by introducing measures to promote *de facto* equality between men and women,

Recalling article 4.1 of the Convention,

## **EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION - TEMPORARY SPECIAL MEASURES (AFFIRMATIVE ACTION)**

Recommends that States parties make more use of temporary special measures such as positive action, preferential treatment or quota systems to advance women's integration into education, the economy, politics and employment.

- CEDAW General Recommendation 23 (Sixteenth session, 1997): Women in Public Life, A/52/38/Rev.1 part II (1997) 61 at para. 15.

...

15. While removal of *de jure* barriers is necessary, it is not sufficient. Failure to achieve full and equal participation of women can be unintentional and the result of outmoded practices and procedures which inadvertently promote men. Under article 4, the Convention encourages the use of temporary special measures in order to give full effect to articles 7 and 8. Where countries have developed effective temporary strategies in an attempt to achieve equality of participation, a wide range of measures has been implemented, including recruiting, financially assisting and training women candidates, amending electoral procedures, developing campaigns directed at equal participation, setting numerical goals and quotas and targeting women for appointment to public positions such as the judiciary or other professional groups that play an essential part in the everyday life of all societies. The formal removal of barriers and the introduction of temporary special measures to encourage the equal participation of both men and women in the public life of their societies are essential prerequisites to true equality in political life. In order, however, to overcome centuries of male domination of the public sphere, women also require the encouragement and support of all sectors of society to achieve full and effective participation, encouragement which must be led by States parties to the Convention, as well as by political parties and public officials. States parties have an obligation to ensure that temporary special measures are clearly designed to support the principle of equality and therefore comply with constitutional principles which guarantee equality to all citizens.

- CEDAW General Recommendation 25 (Thirtieth session, 2004): Article 4, Paragraph 1: Temporary Special Measures, A/59/38 part I (2004) 78 at paras. 1-39.

### I. Introduction

1. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women decided at its twentieth session (1999), pursuant to article 21 of the Convention, to elaborate a general recommendation on article 4, paragraph 1, of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women. This new general recommendation would build, *inter alia*, on earlier general recommendations, including general recommendation No. 5

## **EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION - TEMPORARY SPECIAL MEASURES (AFFIRMATIVE ACTION)**

(seventh session, 1988), on temporary special measures, No. 8 (seventh session, 1988), on the implementation of article 8 of the Convention, and No. 23 (sixteenth session, 1997), on women in public life, as well as on reports of States parties to the Convention and on the Committee's concluding comments on those reports.

2. With the present general recommendation, the Committee aims to clarify the nature and meaning of article 4, paragraph 1, in order to facilitate and ensure its full utilization by States parties in the implementation of the Convention. The Committee encourages States parties to translate this general recommendation into national and local languages and to disseminate it widely to the legislative, executive and judicial branches of government, including their administrative structures, as well as civil society, including the media, academia, and human rights and women's associations and institutions.

### II. Background: the object and purpose of the Convention

3. The Convention is a dynamic instrument. Since the adoption of the Convention in 1979, the Committee, as well as other actors at the national and international levels, have contributed through progressive thinking to the clarification and understanding of the substantive content of the Convention's articles and the specific nature of discrimination against women and the instruments for combating such discrimination.

4. The scope and meaning of article 4, paragraph 1, must be determined in the context of the overall object and purpose of the Convention, which is to eliminate all forms of discrimination against women with a view to achieving women's *de jure* and *de facto* equality with men in the enjoyment of their human rights and fundamental freedoms. States parties to the Convention are under a legal obligation to respect, protect, promote and fulfil this right to non-discrimination for women and to ensure the development and advancement of women in order to improve their position to one of *de jure* as well as *de facto* equality with men.

5. The Convention goes beyond the concept of discrimination used in many national and international legal standards and norms. While such standards and norms prohibit discrimination on the grounds of sex and protect both men and women from treatment based on arbitrary, unfair and/or unjustifiable distinctions, the Convention focuses on discrimination against women, emphasizing that women have suffered, and continue to suffer, from various forms of discrimination because they are women.

6. A joint reading of articles 1 to 5 and 24, which form the general interpretative framework for all of the substantive articles of the Convention, indicates that three obligations are central to States parties' efforts to eliminate discrimination against women. These obligations

## **EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION - TEMPORARY SPECIAL MEASURES (AFFIRMATIVE ACTION)**

should be implemented in an integrated fashion and extend beyond a purely formal legal obligation of equal treatment of women with men.

7. Firstly, States parties' obligation is to ensure that there is no direct or indirect a/ discrimination against women in their laws and that women are protected against discrimination - committed by public authorities, the judiciary, organizations, enterprises or private individuals - in the public as well as the private spheres by competent tribunals as well as sanctions and other remedies. Secondly, States parties' obligation is to improve the *de facto* position of women through concrete and effective policies and programmes. Thirdly, States parties' obligation is to address prevailing gender relations b/ and the persistence of gender-based stereotypes that affect women not only through individual acts by individuals but also in law, and legal and societal structures and institutions.

8. In the Committee's view, a purely formal legal or programmatic approach is not sufficient to achieve women's *de facto* equality with men, which the Committee interprets as substantive equality. In addition, the Convention requires that women be given an equal start and that they be empowered by an enabling environment to achieve equality of results. It is not enough to guarantee women treatment that is identical to that of men. Rather, biological as well as socially and culturally constructed differences between women and men must be taken into account. Under certain circumstances, non-identical treatment of women and men will be required in order to address such differences. Pursuit of the goal of substantive equality also calls for an effective strategy aimed at overcoming underrepresentation of women and a redistribution of resources and power between men and women.

9. Equality of results is the logical corollary of *de facto* or substantive equality. These results may be quantitative and/or qualitative in nature; that is, women enjoying their rights in various fields in fairly equal numbers with men, enjoying the same income levels, equality in decision-making and political influence, and women enjoying freedom from violence.

10. The position of women will not be improved as long as the underlying causes of discrimination against women, and of their inequality, are not effectively addressed. The lives of women and men must be considered in a contextual way, and measures adopted towards a real transformation of opportunities, institutions and systems so that they are no longer grounded in historically determined male paradigms of power and life patterns.

11. Women's biologically determined permanent needs and experiences should be distinguished from other needs that may be the result of past and present discrimination against women by individual actors, the dominant gender ideology, or by manifestations of such discrimination in social and cultural structures and institutions. As steps are being taken to eliminate discrimination against women, women's needs may change or disappear, or

## **EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION - TEMPORARY SPECIAL MEASURES (AFFIRMATIVE ACTION)**

become the needs of both women and men. Thus, continuous monitoring of laws, programmes and practices directed at the achievement of women's *de facto* or substantive equality is needed so as to avoid a perpetuation of non-identical treatment that may no longer be warranted.

12. Certain groups of women, in addition to suffering from discrimination directed against them as women, may also suffer from multiple forms of discrimination based on additional grounds such as race, ethnic or religious identity, disability, age, class, caste or other factors. Such discrimination may affect these groups of women primarily, or to a different degree or in different ways than men. States parties may need to take specific temporary special measures to eliminate such multiple forms of discrimination against women and its compounded negative impact on them.

13. In addition to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, other international human rights instruments and policy documents adopted in the United Nations system contain provisions on temporary special measures to support the achievement of equality. Such measures are described in different terminology, and the meaning and interpretation given to such measures also differs. It is the Committee's hope that the present general recommendation on article 4, paragraph 1, will contribute to a clarification of terminology. c/

14. The Convention targets discriminatory dimensions of past and current societal and cultural contexts which impede women's enjoyment of their human rights and fundamental freedoms. It aims at the elimination of all forms of discrimination against women, including the elimination of the causes and consequences of their *de facto* or substantive inequality. Therefore, the application of temporary special measures in accordance with the Convention is one of the means to realize *de facto* or substantive equality for women, rather than an exception to the norms of non-discrimination and equality.

### III. The meaning and scope of temporary special measures in the Convention

#### *Article 4, paragraph 1*

Adoption by States parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating *de facto* equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved.

## **EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION - TEMPORARY SPECIAL MEASURES (AFFIRMATIVE ACTION)**

### *Article 4, paragraph 2*

Adoption by States parties of special measures, including those measures contained in the present Convention, aimed at protecting maternity shall not be considered discriminatory.

### *A. Relationship between paragraphs 1 and 2 of article 4*

15. There is a clear difference between the purpose of the “special measures” under article 4, paragraph 1, and those of paragraph 2. The purpose of article 4, paragraph 1, is to accelerate the improvement of the position of women to achieve their *de facto* or substantive equality with men, and to effect the structural, social and cultural changes necessary to correct past and current forms and effects of discrimination against women, as well as to provide them with compensation. These measures are of a temporary nature.

16. Article 4, paragraph 2, provides for non-identical treatment of women and men due to their biological differences. These measures are of a permanent nature, at least until such time as the scientific and technological knowledge referred to in article 11, paragraph 3, would warrant a review.

### *B. Terminology*

17. The *travaux préparatoires* of the Convention use different terms to describe the “temporary special measures” included in article 4, paragraph 1. The Committee itself, in its previous general recommendations, used various terms. States parties often equate “special measures” in its corrective, compensatory and promotional sense with the terms “affirmative action”, “positive action”, “positive measures”, “reverse discrimination”, and “positive discrimination”. These terms emerge from the discussions and varied practices found in different national contexts. d/ In the present general recommendation, and in accordance with its practice in the consideration of reports of States parties, the Committee uses solely the term “temporary special measures”, as called for in article 4, paragraph 1.

### *C. Key elements of article 4, paragraph 1*

18. Measures taken under article 4, paragraph 1, by States parties should aim to accelerate the equal participation of women in the political, economic, social, cultural, civil or any other field. The Committee views the application of these measures not as an exception to the norm of non-discrimination, but rather as an emphasis that temporary special measures are part of a necessary strategy by States parties directed towards the achievement of *de facto* or substantive equality of women with men in the enjoyment of their human rights and fundamental freedoms. While the application of temporary special measures often remedies



## **EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION - TEMPORARY SPECIAL MEASURES (AFFIRMATIVE ACTION)**

the effects of past discrimination against women, the obligation of States parties under the Convention to improve the position of women to one of *de facto* or substantive equality with men exists irrespective of any proof of past discrimination. The Committee considers that States parties that adopt and implement such measures under the Convention do not discriminate against men.

19. States parties should clearly distinguish between temporary special measures taken under article 4, paragraph 1, to accelerate the achievement of a concrete goal for women of *de facto* or substantive equality, and other general social policies adopted to improve the situation of women and the girl child. Not all measures that potentially are, or will be, favourable to women are temporary special measures. The provision of general conditions in order to guarantee the civil, political, economic, social and cultural rights of women and the girl child, designed to ensure for them a life of dignity and non-discrimination, cannot be called temporary special measures.

20. Article 4, paragraph 1, explicitly states the “temporary” nature of such special measures. Such measures should therefore not be deemed necessary forever, even though the meaning of “temporary” may, in fact, result in the application of such measures for a long period of time. The duration of a temporary special measure should be determined by its functional result in response to a concrete problem and not by a predetermined passage of time. Temporary special measures must be discontinued when their desired results have been achieved and sustained for a period of time.

21. The term “special”, though being in conformity with human rights discourse, also needs to be carefully explained. Its use sometimes casts women and other groups who are subject to discrimination as weak, vulnerable and in need of extra or “special” measures in order to participate or compete in society. However, the real meaning of “special” in the formulation of article 4, paragraph 1, is that the measures are designed to serve a specific goal.

22. The term “measures” encompasses a wide variety of legislative, executive, administrative and other regulatory instruments, policies and practices, such as outreach or support programmes; allocation and/or reallocation of resources; preferential treatment; targeted recruitment, hiring and promotion; numerical goals connected with time frames; and quota systems. The choice of a particular “measure” will depend on the context in which article 4, paragraph 1, is applied and on the specific goal it aims to achieve.

23. The adoption and implementation of temporary special measures may lead to a discussion of the qualifications and merit of the group or individuals so targeted, and an argument against preferences for allegedly lesser-qualified women over men in areas such as politics, education and employment. As temporary special measures aim at accelerating

## **EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION - TEMPORARY SPECIAL MEASURES (AFFIRMATIVE ACTION)**

the achievement of *de facto* or substantive equality, questions of qualification and merit, in particular in the area of employment in the public and private sectors, need to be reviewed carefully for gender bias as they are normatively and culturally determined. For appointment, selection or election to public and political office, factors other than qualification and merit, including the application of the principles of democratic fairness and electoral choice, may also have to play a role.

24. Article 4, paragraph 1, read in conjunction with articles 1, 2, 3, 5 and 24, needs to be applied in relation to articles 6 to 16 which stipulate that States parties “shall take all appropriate measures”. Consequently, the Committee considers that States parties are obliged to adopt and implement temporary special measures in relation to any of these articles if such measures can be shown to be necessary and appropriate in order to accelerate the achievement of overall, or a specific goal of, women’s *de facto* or substantive equality.

### IV. Recommendations to States parties

25. Reports of States parties should include information on the adoption, or lack thereof, of temporary special measures in accordance with article 4, paragraph 1, of the Convention, and States parties should preferably adhere to the terminology “temporary special measures”, to avoid confusion.

26. States parties should clearly distinguish between temporary special measures aimed at accelerating the achievement of a concrete goal of women’s *de facto* or substantive equality, and other general social policies adopted and implemented in order to improve the situation of women and the girl child. States parties should bear in mind that not all measures which potentially are or would be favourable to women qualify as temporary special measures.

27. States parties should analyse the context of women’s situation in all spheres of life, as well as in the specific, targeted area, when applying temporary special measures to accelerate the achievement of women’s *de facto* or substantive equality. They should evaluate the potential impact of temporary special measures with regard to a particular goal within their national context and adopt those temporary special measures which they consider to be the most appropriate to accelerate the achievement of *de facto* or substantive equality for women.

28. States parties should explain the reasons for choosing one type of measure over another. The justification for applying such measures should include a description of the actual life situation of women, including the conditions and influences which shape their lives and opportunities - or that of a specific group of women, suffering from multiple forms of discrimination - and whose position the State party intends to improve in an accelerated manner with the application of such temporary special measures. At the same time, the

## **EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION - TEMPORARY SPECIAL MEASURES (AFFIRMATIVE ACTION)**

relationship between such measures and general measures and efforts to improve the position of women should be clarified.

29. States parties should provide adequate explanations with regard to any failure to adopt temporary special measures. Such failures may not be justified simply by averring powerlessness, or by explaining inaction through predominant market or political forces, such as those inherent in the private sector, private organizations, or political parties. States parties are reminded that article 2 of the Convention, which needs to be read in conjunction with all other articles, imposes accountability on the State party for action by these actors.

30. States parties may report on temporary special measures under several articles. Under article 2, States parties are invited to report on the legal or other basis for such measures, and their justification for choosing a particular approach. States parties are further invited to give details about any legislation concerning temporary special measures, and in particular whether such legislation provides for the mandatory or voluntary nature of temporary special measures.

31. States parties should include, in their constitutions or in their national legislation, provisions that allow for the adoption of temporary special measures. The Committee reminds States parties that legislation, such as comprehensive anti-discrimination acts, equal opportunities acts or executive orders on women's equality, can give guidance on the type of temporary special measures that should be applied to achieve a stated goal, or goals, in given areas. Such guidance can also be contained in specific legislation on employment or education. Relevant legislation on non-discrimination and temporary special measures should cover governmental actors as well as private organizations or enterprises.

32. The Committee draws the attention of States parties to the fact that temporary special measures may also be based on decrees, policy directives and/or administrative guidelines formulated and adopted by national, regional or local executive branches of government to cover the public employment and education sectors. Such temporary special measures may include the civil service, the political sphere and the private education and employment sectors. The Committee further draws the attention of States parties to the fact that such measures may also be negotiated between social partners of the public or private employment sector or be applied on a voluntary basis by public or private enterprises, organizations, institutions and political parties.

33. The Committee reiterates that action plans for temporary special measures need to be designed, applied and evaluated within the specific national context and against the background of the specific nature of the problem which they are intended to overcome. The Committee recommends that States parties provide in their reports details of any action plans

## **EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION - TEMPORARY SPECIAL MEASURES (AFFIRMATIVE ACTION)**

which may be directed at creating access for women and overcoming their underrepresentation in certain fields, at redistributing resources and power in particular areas, and/or at initiating institutional change to overcome past or present discrimination and accelerate the achievement of *de facto* equality. Reports should also explain whether such action plans include considerations of unintended potential adverse side effects of such measures as well as possible action to protect women against them. States parties should also describe in their reports the results of temporary special measures and assess the causes of the possible failure of such measures.

34. Under article 3, States parties are invited to report on the institution(s) responsible for designing, implementing, monitoring, evaluating and enforcing such temporary special measures. Such responsibility may be vested in existing or planned national institutions, such as women's ministries, women's departments within ministries or presidential offices, ombudspersons, tribunals or other entities of a public or private nature with the requisite mandate to design specific programmes, monitor their implementation, and evaluate their impact and outcomes. The Committee recommends that States parties ensure that women in general, and affected groups of women in particular, have a role in the design, implementation and evaluation of such programmes. Collaboration and consultation with civil society and non-governmental organizations representing various groups of women is especially recommended.

35. The Committee draws attention to and reiterates its general recommendation No. 9, on statistical data concerning the situation of women, and recommends that States parties provide statistical data disaggregated by sex in order to measure the achievement of progress towards women's *de facto* or substantive equality and the effectiveness of temporary special measures.

36. States parties should report on the type of temporary special measures taken in specific fields under the relevant article(s) of the Convention. Reporting under the respective article(s) should include references to concrete goals and targets, timetables, the reasons for choosing particular measures, steps to enable women to access such measures, and the institution accountable for monitoring implementation and progress. States parties are also asked to describe how many women are affected by a measure, how many would gain access and participate in a certain field because of a temporary special measure, or the amount of resources and power it aims to redistribute to how many women, and within what time frame.

37. The Committee reiterates its general recommendations 5, 8 and 23, wherein it recommended the application of temporary special measures in the fields of education, the economy, politics and employment, in the area of women representing their Governments at the international level and participating in the work of international organizations, and in

## **EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION - TEMPORARY SPECIAL MEASURES (AFFIRMATIVE ACTION)**

the area of political and public life. States parties should intensify, within their national contexts, such efforts especially with regard to all facets of education at all levels as well as all facets and levels of training, employment and representation in public and political life. The Committee recalls that in all instances, but particularly in the area of health, States parties should carefully distinguish in each field between measures of an ongoing and permanent nature and those of a temporary nature.

38. States parties are reminded that temporary special measures should be adopted to accelerate the modification and elimination of cultural practices and stereotypical attitudes and behaviour that discriminate against or are disadvantageous for women. Temporary special measures should also be implemented in the areas of credit and loans, sports, culture and recreation, and legal awareness. Where necessary, such measures should be directed at women subjected to multiple discrimination, including rural women.

39. Although the application of temporary special measures may not be possible under all the articles of the Convention, the Committee recommends that their adoption be considered whenever issues of accelerating access to equal participation, on the one hand, and accelerating the redistribution of power and resources, on the other hand, are involved as well as where it can be shown that these measures will be necessary and most appropriate under the circumstances.

---

### Notes

a/ Indirect discrimination against women may occur when laws, policies and programmes are based on seemingly gender-neutral criteria which in their actual effect have a detrimental impact on women. Gender-neutral laws, policies and programmes unintentionally may perpetuate the consequences of past discrimination. They may be inadvertently modelled on male lifestyles and thus fail to take into account aspects of women's life experiences which may differ from those of men. These differences may exist because of stereotypical expectations, attitudes and behaviour directed towards women which are based on the biological differences between women and men. They may also exist because of the generally existing subordination of women by men.

b/ "Gender is defined as the social meanings given to biological sex differences. It is an ideological and cultural construct, but is also reproduced within the realm of material practices; in turn it influences the outcomes of such practices. It affects the distribution of resources, wealth, work, decision-making and political power, and enjoyment of rights and entitlements within the family as well as public life. Despite variations across cultures and over time, gender relations throughout the world entail asymmetry of power between men and women as a pervasive trait. Thus, gender is a social stratifier, and in this sense it is

## **EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION - TEMPORARY SPECIAL MEASURES (AFFIRMATIVE ACTION)**

similar to other stratifiers such as race, class, ethnicity, sexuality, and age. It helps us understand the social construction of gender identities and the unequal structure of power that underlies the relationship between the sexes.” *1999 World Survey on the Role of Women in Development*, United Nations, New York, 1999, page ix.

c/ See, for example, the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, which mandates temporary special measures. The practice of treaty monitoring bodies, including the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, and the Human Rights Committee, shows that these bodies consider the application of temporary special measures as mandatory to achieve the purposes of the respective treaties. Conventions adopted under the auspices of the International Labour Organization, and various documents of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization also explicitly or implicitly provide for such measures. The Subcommission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights considered this question and appointed a Special Rapporteur to prepare reports for its consideration and action. The Commission on the Status of Women reviewed the use of temporary special measures in 1992. The outcome documents adopted by United Nations world conferences on women, including the Platform for Action of the 1995 Fourth World Conference on Women and its follow-up review of 2000, contain references to positive action as a tool for achieving de facto equality. The use of temporary special measures by the Secretary-General of the United Nations is a practical example in the area of women’s employment, including through administrative instructions on the recruitment, promotion and placement of women in the Secretariat. These measures aim at achieving the goal of 50/50 gender distribution at all levels, but at the higher echelons in particular.

d/ The term “affirmative action” is used in the United States of America and in a number of United Nations documents, whereas the term “positive action” is currently widely used in Europe as well as in many United Nations documents. However, the term “positive action” is used in yet another sense in international human rights law to describe “positive State action” (the obligation of a State to initiate action versus a State’s obligation to abstain from action). Hence, the term “positive action” is ambiguous inasmuch as its meaning is not confined to temporary special measures as understood in article 4, paragraph 1, of the Convention. The terms “reverse discrimination” or “positive discrimination” are criticized by a number of commentators as inappropriate.

- 
- CERD General Recommendation XXVII (Fifty-seventh session, 2000): Discrimination Against Roma, A/55/18 (2000) 154 at paras. 15, 23, 28, 29 and 41. For text of General Recommendation, see **EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION - RACIAL**

**EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION -  
TEMPORARY SPECIAL MEASURES (AFFIRMATIVE ACTION)**

DISCRIMINATION.

- CERD General Recommendation XXIX (Sixty-first session, 2002): On Article 1, Paragraph 1, of the Convention (Descent), A/57/18 (2002) 111 at paras. e, f and h. For text of General Recommendation, see **EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION - RACIAL DISCRIMINATION**.
  
- ICESCR General Comment 16 (Thirty-fourth session, 2005): Article 3: The Equal Right of Men and Women to the Enjoyment of all Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, E/2006/22 (2005) 116 at paras. 10, 15, 21, 35 and 36. For text of General Comment, see **EQUALITY AND DISCRIMINATION - GENDER DISCRIMINATION - General**.